

A Rubric for Evaluating Lesson Study

Lois Brown Easton

Part One: Refinement of the Lesson

Characteristic	Beginning	Improving	Advanced	Accomplished
<p><u>Collaboration:</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> •Pausing •Paraphrasing •Probing for specificity •Putting ideas on the table •Paying attention to self and others •Presuming positive intentions •Practicing a balance of inquiry & advocacy <p>From Garmston & Wellman, <i>Adaptive Schools</i>, 1997</p>	<p>Participants either do not engage in refinement of the lesson or do so with one or two other people, not engaging with the entire group.</p> <p>Side conversations are common – some off topic.</p> <p>Participants may advocate for their own ideas, rather than building on others' ideas.</p> <p>It may seem that participants are in competition with each other for the best idea.</p> <p>They may harshly criticize someone else's idea or make fun of it.</p> <p>The atmosphere is somewhat tense and restrained.</p>	<p>Most participants contribute their own ideas or respond to others' ideas.</p> <p>Some may engage in side conversations about the lesson.</p> <p>Most participants begin to listen to each other, pausing and asking questions.</p> <p>Some participants advocate for their ideas and regard others' ideas as competition.</p> <p>Some participants inquire about others' ideas, trying to build upon them.</p> <p>The atmosphere is convivial.</p>	<p>Most participants contribute their own ideas and/or build on what others say.</p> <p>There are no side conversations on or off the topic.</p> <p>Some participants paraphrase what someone else has said before building on it.</p> <p>Participants ask others to comment on ideas.</p> <p>Participants share their ideas with a sense of tentativeness, rather than advocacy.</p> <p>The atmosphere is collegial.</p>	<p>Participants contribute their own ideas as suggestions.</p> <p>They may share their thinking (or assumptions).</p> <p>They ask each other to provide details or examples, or they "try out" details or examples to see if they fit.</p> <p>They paraphrase, checking to be sure they (and the group) understand the idea.</p> <p>Participants comment on how the dialogue is going; they are metacognitive about it ("I think we're doing well getting ideas out on the table" or "I'm not sure we've addressed all the angles.").</p> <p>The "final" ideas are often a result of many contributions to an initial idea.</p> <p>A positive "we're all in this</p>

Characteristic	Beginning	Improving	Advanced	Accomplished
				together” atmosphere signals collaboration.
<u>A Better Lesson</u>	<p>If a given lesson, it is not much better than it was.</p> <p>If a newly “created” lesson, it is probably one that one of the team has taught, and the others agree to use that lesson, without much analysis.</p>	<p>If a given lesson, it is improved, but only in surface ways.</p> <p>If a newly “created” lesson, it is standard and sufficient but not particularly effective in terms of engaging students and helping them learn.</p>	<p>The given lesson is improved, but participants don’t get into the deep structural aspects of the lesson.</p> <p>The “created” lesson includes some effective teaching strategies or moves, such as building background knowledge and checking for understanding.</p>	<p>The lesson is vastly improved because participants have gone deeply into the logic and design of the lesson.</p> <p>The “created” lesson works because it is based on knowledge of students and how they learn and includes all aspects of an effective lesson.</p>

Part Two: Teaching the Lesson and Collecting Data

Characteristic	Beginning	Improving	Advanced	Accomplished
<u>Teacher Role</u>	<p>The teacher improvises, perhaps teaching a lesson she/he has already taught, but not necessarily adhering to the “planned” lesson.</p> <p>The lesson does not really work or, if it does, it works because of the idiosyncrasies of the teacher.</p>	<p>The teacher basically adheres to the planned lesson.</p> <p>The teacher’s style is, however, evident and noticeable, sometimes distracting from the lesson.</p>	<p>The teacher adheres to the planned lesson, but is attentive to the needs of students and adjusts the lesson but in a way that may distract from the lesson.</p> <p>Style does not interfere with the lesson.</p>	<p>Aspects of style that are important to student success, such as asking follow-up questions, are built-in to the lesson, so that any teacher could teach the lesson well. The teacher is attentive to the needs of students and adjusts the lesson accordingly, but style does not distract from the lesson design.</p>
<u>Data Collection Roles</u>	<p>The data collectors may be intrusive.</p> <p>They may be focused more on what the teacher is doing rather than what the students are doing.</p>	<p>Data collectors are not particularly intrusive, but they may be focused more on what the teacher is doing and less on what the students are doing.</p>	<p>Data collectors are focused on specific aspects of the lesson, especially the decisions the lesson study team made to create or improve the lesson.</p>	<p>Data collectors collect relevant data about generic strategies used in great lessons, specific strategies used to meet the goals of this lesson, and “moves” that the lesson includes,</p>

Characteristic	Beginning	Improving	Advanced	Accomplished
	<p>They may be focused on collecting data that is not particularly relevant to the lesson.</p> <p>They may be unsure what constitutes evidence related to data they are to collect.</p>	<p>They may be collecting data that are related to generic concerns, rather than specific decisions (curricular, instructional, assessment) made by the lesson study team.</p> <p>They may still not be clear about what constitutes evidence related to the data they are to collect.</p> <p>Data collectors look for the effects on student learning or behavior as a result of teacher changes in the lesson.</p>	<p>They collect data on instructional moves, curriculum decisions, and formative and summative assessment strategies.</p> <p>They are clear about what they are looking for: evidence/behavior that indicates that students are/are not learning.</p>	<p>such as those related to curriculum, instruction, and assessment.</p> <p>They have analyzed the behaviors and signs of learning that indicate whether or not a lesson is working and are collecting exactly the right data for the lesson.</p> <p>Data collectors are alert to changes in the lesson that signal that different data might be collected. They adjust data collection accordingly.</p>
General	Students are not engaged in the lesson and/or not showing evidence of learning.	Students may be engaged in the lesson, but they do not show evidence of learning.	Students are engaged in the lesson and show evidence of learning parts of the lesson.	Students are engaged and learning. They may show evidence of extending their learning or working in a more self-directed manner or collaboratively than they might have if the lesson had not been refined.

Part Three: Colloquium

Characteristic	Beginning	Improving	Advanced	Accomplished
<u>Teacher Presentation</u>	<p>The teacher begins the colloquium and is not interrupted by others while reporting.</p> <p>The teacher describes what he/she did in the lesson,</p>	<p>The teacher describes the lesson with some reference to what “we” (meaning the lesson study group) decided as well as what he/she did.</p> <p>The teacher begins to</p>	<p>The teacher refers regularly to the lesson “we” (referring to the lesson design team) designed.</p> <p>The teacher reflects on the results of the lesson design.</p>	The teacher reflects on what could be done to further improve the lesson.

	<p>using the word "I."</p> <p>The teacher does not reflect on the results of what he/she did, according to what the lesson required.</p> <p>The teacher may reflect on changes that he/she made in the lesson, according to student needs, but the lesson itself may have been so idiosyncratic to the teacher that modifications are not self-evident.</p>	<p>reflect on the results of the lesson design.</p> <p>The teacher reflects on changes that he/she made in the lesson decided upon by the lesson study team, explaining what he/she did, but not always presenting the incentive nor the results of changing the lesson.</p>	<p>The teacher describes changes he/she made in the lesson and why, as well as results of the changes on student learning.</p>	
<u>Data Collectors' Presentations</u>	<p>The data collectors report on the data they collected, one at a time, without being interrupted.</p>	<p>The data collectors suggest the meaning or importance of the data they collected.</p>	<p>The data collectors connect their data to the teacher's report on the lesson as well as to data collected by other data collectors.</p>	<p>The data collectors suggest what the lesson team might learn from the data they collected.</p>
<u>Learning & Application</u>	<p>The lesson study group does not summarize their learning as a result of the lesson study cycle.</p>	<p>The lesson study group works together to summarize key learning the team did as a result of the lesson study cycle.</p>	<p>The lesson study group speculates about how the lesson currently under study might be further improved and makes a decision about whether or not to improve that lesson or move on.</p>	<p>The lesson study group keeps a journal of learning related to the lessons they study; they also keep a portfolio of artifacts related to lesson study and periodically examine it to note progress.</p>