Contributions of International Large Scale Assessments in Civic Engagement and Citizenship

Judith Torney-Purta
Jo-Ann Amadeo
Department of Human Development
University of Maryland College Park
A Developmental Psychology Analogy
For the “Development” of IEA

• Early childhood – diffuse discovery-’60s
• School age – specific subject focus-’70-85
• Adolescence – growth spurt-’85-90s
• Emerging maturity – into the future
  – Balanced portfolio of studies (BICSE)
  – Beyond country rankings, SES gaps
  – Opportunities for wide secondary analysis to study educational processes
  – Innovative areas and approaches
The Focus of Studies in Civic Engagement and Citizenship

• “Political socialization” research was interdisciplinary study of young people’s political attitudes
• Studies of “civic education” added knowledge and cognition
• “Civic engagement” now includes the cognitive, attitudinal and behavioral
• Our focus is broadened with “workplace competencies”
Since the changes in Eastern Europe

• Rise of a global discourse on human rights
• Need for more mature comparative studies
• More interest in civic topics across nations
  – IEA General Assembly proposal for civic education study (‘93)
  – IEA Civic Education Study, Phase 1 ’94-’99
  – **IEA Civic Education Study Phase 2, CIVED test and survey, ’95-’02**
  – OECD’s work DeSeCo, Student Approaches to Learning ’97-‘07
  – IEA International Civic and Citizenship ’05-’10
Education not a simple issue

• Some economists and educational policy makers argue high science/math achievement is a precondition for economic success
• International results in the U.S. are greeted with “hand wringing” about education
• Countries with high cognitive performance aren’t complacent
• Disconnection between education and other aspects of globalization
• Economic stagnation due to “low hanging fruit”
Conclusions from the ETS Angoff Memorial Lecture
(Delivered by Michael Feurer, February 18, 2011)

• The US does poorly in science/math achievement
• However, our economy is not dreadful
• Suggests the importance of
  – the democratic values held by most students
  – the history of young peoples’ engagement with political institutions/social movements at all levels
  – how they learn to understand media messages and frame problems in communities or workplaces to find innovative solutions
Broader questions

• Have we been looking in the wrong places for the roots of success for our societies and economies?

• Is it possible that our current assessments are too narrow to be of policy value?
  – Remember the joke about the man looking for his keys under a lamp post because it was easier to see there
Using secondary analysis of CIVED data to convince you of the value of

• Studies assessing outcomes like these:
  – conceptual knowledge about their nations
  – positive values for democratic engagement
  – positive attitudes toward ethnic groups
  – achievement and skills important in community or workplace
• Studies designed to inform policy by “unpacking” contexts and processes
• Studies that intersect global discourses
An Example of an ILSA that was Focused on Outcomes and Processes Similar to These
Two Datasets

• IEA Study of Civic Education (CIVED99)
  – Focus groups and case studies in 1995
  – Achievement test and attitude survey given 1999 with results released in 2001
  – 90,000 14-year-olds from 28 countries
    • Nationally representative samples of schools

• IEA Study of Civic Education (ICCS09)
  – 38 countries, results recently released
Countries Testing in CIVED Study at Age 14

• Australia, England, United States
• Belgium (French), Cyprus, Germany, Greece, Italy, Portugal, Switzerland
• Hong Kong (SAR)
• Denmark, Finland, Norway, Sweden
• Estonia, Latvia, Lithuania
• Bulgaria, Czech Republic, Hungary, Poland, Romania, Russian Federation, Slovak Republic, Slovenia
• Chile, Colombia
Diverse Aspects and Patterns of Achievement and Engagement among Adolescents across Nations
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>Interpretive Skills (media, fact/opinion)</th>
<th>Conceptual Civic Knowledge</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>112-15</td>
<td>U.S.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>109-12</td>
<td>Finland</td>
<td>Poland</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>105-8</td>
<td>Australia, Poland, England, Italy</td>
<td>Finland, Italy, SlovakRep</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>101-4</td>
<td>SlovakRep, Norway, CzechRep, Germany, Sweden</td>
<td>CzechRep, Norway, U.S</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>100</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>96-99</td>
<td>BelgiumF</td>
<td>Australia, Germany, England, Sweden, Portugal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>92-95</td>
<td>Portugal, Estonia, Latvia</td>
<td>BelgiumF, Estonia, Latvia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>88-91</td>
<td>Chile</td>
<td>Chile</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
“Smaller grain size” Analysis of CIVED Cognitive Test (with T. Zhang)

• The Cognitive Diagnostic Approach found
  – Four dimensions in US and Australia
    • Basic concept knowledge, Advanced concept knowledge
    • Media skills, Advanced skills
  – Cognitive profiles could be identified
  – Basic concept knowledge prerequisite for more complex concepts
  – Skills may develop independent of basic concepts
  – Conceptually based teaching associated with achievement of competent profiles
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>Support Norms of Conventional Citizenship</th>
<th>Support Norms of Social-Movement Citizenship</th>
<th>Support for Rights of Ethnic Groups</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>10.9-11</td>
<td>Chile Poland</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.5-.8</td>
<td>Chile Portugal</td>
<td>U.S. England Poland Portugal</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.1-.4</td>
<td><strong>U.S.</strong> Italy Portugal SlovakR</td>
<td><strong>U.S.</strong> SlovakR Italy Norway Poland</td>
<td>Finland BelgF Norway Sweden</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.0</td>
<td>Latvia</td>
<td></td>
<td>Austrl Chile</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.6-.9</td>
<td>Germany</td>
<td>Germany Sweden CzechR</td>
<td>CzR Estn Italy SlovR</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.2-.5</td>
<td>Austrl Sweden BelgF Eng CzR Norway Estn</td>
<td>Latvia Austrl Eng Estn</td>
<td>Latvia Germany</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.8-.9.1</td>
<td><strong>Finland</strong></td>
<td>BelgF <strong>Finland</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The importance of these attitudes led to identifying clusters of individuals

- 2 step cluster analyses using 12 attitudinal variables from IEA CIVED survey data
- 30,000 14-year-olds from 10 countries
  - Western European: Australia, England, Finland, Sweden, U.S.
  - Eastern European: Bulgaria, Czech Republic, Estonia, Hungary, Latvia
Questions addressed in the cluster analysis

• Are there groups of adolescents with coherent and distinctive patterns of social, political and intercultural attitudes?
• Do cluster patterns and distributions of membership differ by region/country?
• What other beliefs characterize clusters?
• How do individuals’ characteristics and school contexts relate to intercultural attitudes?
Some of the attitudinal variables serving as the basis of clustering

(International M=10; SD=2)

- Support for Minority Rights,
- Support for Immigrant Rights
- Protectionist Attitudes (Nationalism)
- Positive Attitudes to Nation (Patriotism)
- Trust in Government Institutions
- Government’s Social Responsibilities
- Norms of Conventional Citizen Participation
- Norms of Social Movement Participation
Parallel Cluster Group 1

• Social Justice Cluster
  – Support for minority and immigrant rights
  – Low support for norms of conventional or social movement action
  – **Motto**: “I believe in rights for all but do not feel obligated to do much about it.”
Parallel Cluster Group 2

• Conventionally Political Cluster
  – High trust in government institutions
  – Believe in norms of conventional and social oriented citizen action
  – In Eastern Europe protectionist and patriotic
  – In Western Europe support social justice
  – Motto: “I believe in my country and will support the status quo with expected political and civic activities.”
Parallel Cluster Groups 3 and 4

• Indifferent Cluster
  – All attitudes very close to the mean
  – Will do the minimum expected

• Disaffected Cluster
  – More negative than Indifferent but not extreme

• Motto for both clusters:
  – “I have better ways to spend my time than thinking about politics, but I won’t do anything rash.”
Parallel Cluster Group 5

- Alienated Cluster (Anti-Social Justice)
  - Uniformly negative attitudes about rights for minorities and immigrants
  - Trust 1 ½ SDs below the international mean
  - **Motto:** I’m angry about the immigrants and minority groups in my country, and I don’t trust the government. I have the right to do what I want.”
Distributions of Cluster Groups in “Western Europe” (%)
Distribution of Cluster Groups in “Eastern Europe” (%)
Summary of Cluster Analysis

• In all countries more than half are Indifferent, Disaffected, or Alienated
• Conventional is second largest cluster only in U.S.
• About 7% are Alienated
  – Higher in Bulgaria
Civic Beliefs in Cluster Groups

• 25% of Alienated youth think it is “not important to obey the law”
  – 1% for Conventional; 6% for Disaffected

• Alienated youth expect to protest

• Positive Social Justice oriented do not expect to protest
Who are the Alienated Students in Socio-culturally Diverse Societies?

• Alienated Cluster members more likely:
  – To be male
  – To spend extensive time with peers outside the home
  – To lack a sense of membership in the school community
  – To lack the experience of a respectful climate for discussion in their classrooms
  – To be from low SES only in Eastern Europe
“Unpacking” National Context with CIVED Data
Percent of Chilean 14-year-olds Answering Questions about Ideals Correctly

- Ideal Democracy: 61% (Chile), 65% (International)
- Democratic Organ.: 69% (Chile), 69% (International)
Percent of Chilean 14-year-olds Answering Potential Threats Questions Correctly

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Topic</th>
<th>Chile</th>
<th>International</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>After Dictator</td>
<td>37%</td>
<td>54%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Press Diversity</td>
<td>40%</td>
<td>57%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Violation Rights</td>
<td>34%</td>
<td>53%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Focus on Predicting Positive Attitudes to Immigrants and to Human Rights

• Living in a national context where
  – the government takes human rights seriously in dealing with other governments
  – policies allow immigrants to apply for citizenship relatively soon after arrival

• Having a school context where
  – students have a say in how the school runs
  – open discussion is welcome in the classroom
  – opportunities for contact with diverse groups
Findings of Concern in Cohort Who Are Now Young Adults

• Substantial proportions had strong anti-immigrant feelings at 14 years of age
  – between 7 and 10% across countries
• Sense of national identity in many students based on exclusion of immigrants or ethnic groups
• Small proportions of teachers think anti-racism education is important
Analysis of Adolescents’ Workplace Competencies in Relation to Classroom Processes
Background

• Reason for the analysis
  – Gap in empirical research base about workplace competencies
  – Close match between data in IEA CIVED study and lists of workplace competencies
Workplace Competencies
[Also 21st Century]

• Media literacy (ability to understand communications in a variety of formats)
• Ability to understand the economic system and global factors
• Ability to solve problems with civic dimensions
• Skill in cooperative work with diverse others
• Information and communications technology
• Creativity and innovation
Workplace Competencies in CIVED

• Knowledge-based competencies
  – Media Literacy Skills (13 items)
  – Economics Knowledge (12 items)

• Behaviorally-based competencies
  – Follows the News Media (2 items)
  – Experience at School with Diversity, Cooperation and Learning about Other Countries (3 items)

• Attitudinally-based competencies
  – Sense of Efficacy in Discussing Issues (4 items)
  – Norms of Social/Civic Responsibility (4 items)
  – Attitudes toward Ethnic Minorities (4 items)
Comparison of Educational Groups

– Aim: Identify groups reflecting different experiences in social studies classrooms

– Open classroom climate for discussion (5 item scale)
  – Sample: “Students feel free to express opinions in class even when their opinions are different from most of the other students.”

– Traditional teaching (4 item scale)
  – Sample: “Teachers lecture and the students take notes.”
## Educational Groups

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Traditional teaching</th>
<th>Open class climate</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Low</td>
<td>Low: Neither</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>High: Interactive</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>High</td>
<td>Low: Lecture</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>High: Both</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Media Literacy Skills (Means) by Educational Group

![Bar chart showing the means of media literacy skills for different educational groups: Neither, Lecture, Interactive, Both. The Interactive group has the highest mean, followed by Both, Lecture, and Neither.]
Attitude toward Ethnic Groups (Means) by Educational Experience

- Neither
- Lecture
- Interactive
- Both
Mean Learning Experiences (Means) by Educational Group

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Neither</th>
<th>Lecture</th>
<th>Interactive</th>
<th>Both</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Understand others</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cooperate in groups</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Both</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Mean Norms of Responsibility (Means) by Educational Experience

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Lecture</th>
<th>Interactive</th>
<th>Both</th>
<th>Neither</th>
<th>Lecture</th>
<th>Interactive</th>
<th>Both</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Works hard</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Obeys the law</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Summary of Findings

• Both interactive and lecture-based classes foster 21st Century competencies
• Students who have neither experience lower on all competencies
• Interactive discussion (alone or with lecture) superior to lecture-based alone on all competencies examined
• Similar results in Estonia, Latvia, Russia
Bringing into focus what we hope we have accomplished
We hope we have convinced you of

- The potential of including studies in civic engagement and citizenship in ILSAs to contribute an understanding of
  - diverse outcomes with patterns sometimes different from math/science achievement
  - skills all young adults need in their nations or communities (and also workplaces)
  - the nature and extent of rise in Xenophobic attitudes in Western Europe
  - adolescents’ social contexts across nations
Further, we hope to have convinced you that

- Including studies like CIVED and ICCS in ILSA provides the potential for primary and secondary analysis focused on
  - achievement scores in an important domain
  - clusters or profiles of attitudes
  - youth attitudes paralleling adult attitudes (ISSP)
  - the national context as it influences students
  - the school context and the importance of open classroom climates and processes
Finally, some broad recommendations

- Exploring an ILSA of “preparation for citizenship” (“or citizenship and workplace”) incorporating
  - existing items and scales (cost-effective)
  - current global discourses
- Incorporating reflections from international perspectives into all ILSAs
  - establish an international group to reflect about studies/secondary analysis and retain an innovative edge
  - seek funding for international early career scholars
Thanks
To colleagues for presentation help and feedback
(Further details: jtpurta@umd.edu)